

DMMP Clarification Paper New DMMP Guidelines for Phthalates

Prepared by Thomas H. Gries (Washington Department of Ecology, Toxics Cleanup Program/Sediment Management Unit) for the DMMP agencies

Introduction

AETs for phthalate compounds were first calculated in 1985 (1). These AET values were based on the highest concentration no effect (“no hit”) level among amphipod mortality, benthic community, Microtox luminescence and oyster abnormality indices of effects. These values were subsequently revised to reflect new synoptic data (2). In 1988, the PSDDA program (now DMMP) adopted screening level guidelines based on one-tenth the highest AET (HAET/10) or the lowest AET (LAET), whichever was lower, as long as the value was greater than the concentration found at reference areas (3, 4). SLs for phthalates, however, were among the exceptions. They were based on the HAET itself. The justifications cited included that these compounds are common laboratory contaminants and exhibit relatively low toxicity.

The first RWG recommended that the PSDDA program set all SL values equal to LAET values that reflect additional amphipod mortality data (5, 6). The majority of the group recommended that SL values should not decline because current guidelines were adequately protective of the disposal site conditions and need not become more stringent. The DMMP agencies agreed with the former recommendation, but disagreed with the latter condition, believing that LAETs should establish the SLs. However, agency staff also noted the different basis for phthalate SLs and the agencies agreed to set phthalate SLs equal to the new HAETs (6, 7).

Problem Identification

The origin of SL values for phthalates used in the DMMP, described above, is inconsistent with the origin of somewhat analogous SQS criteria contained in the SMS rule. The latter are based on LAET values, not HAETs. In addition, SQS values for phthalates and other polar organic compounds are normalized to total organic carbon (OC) content of the sediment instead of dry weight. This results in programmatic inconsistency and potentially conflicting interpretations of data. For example, a sample containing approximately 1000 ug of bis(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate per kilogram of dry weight and 2% organic carbon would have 50 mg bis(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate per kilogram of organic carbon, thereby exceeding the SQS of 47 mg/Kg OC. However, the sample would not exceed the current SL of 8,300 ppb dry weight. Similarly, if the same sample contained 100 ug butylbenzyl phthalate per kilogram of dry weight, it would exceed the comparable SQS of 4.9 mg/Kg OC but not the current SL of 970 ug/Kg dry weight. In the absence of biological test results, this could be interpreted to mean that the sample contributed to the need for site remediation but would be suitable for open water disposal. Of course biological guidelines and standards, which are more consistent between programs, supercede chemical ones.

Proposed Clarification

The DMMP agencies propose to set the screening level for phthalates at the lowest of the original 1988 dry weight-normalized AETs (amphipod, benthic, Microtox and oyster). If adopted, the new SL values will replace the old SLs in the DMMP chemical guidelines. Consistent with current guidelines, DMMP agencies do not propose to establish maximum level guidelines for phthalate compounds or require toxicity testing of samples found to exceed only phthalates SLs.

The potential implications of implementing this change were evaluated and the results are summarized in Table 1 below. None of the 1137 samples among 52 past dredging projects exceeded 1988 or 1998 phthalate SLs *only*. Four of the 1137 samples (0.35%) exceeded *only* the proposed SLs based on LAET values. However, even these four samples would not be required to undergo toxicity testing, because of the existing policy described above. The main benefit of this largely cosmetic proposal is for the DMMP to be more consistent with the SMS program.

Chemical Name	1988 SL ^a	# samples w/ detects >SL	1998 SL ^b	# samples w/ detects > SL	2000 SL ^c	# samples w/ detects > SL
Any chemical	Various	430/1137	Various	171/1137	Various	175/1137
Bis(2ethylhexyl) phthalate	3100	0/245	8300	0/245	1300	10/245
Butbenzophthalate	470	1/52	970	0/52	63	17/52
Diethylphthalate	97	0/22	1200	0/22	200	0/22
Di-n-butylphthalate	1400	0/40	5100	0/40	1400	0/40
Di-n-octylphthalate	69000	0/49	6200	0/49	6200	0/49
Dimethylphthalate	160	0/15	1400	0/15	71	0/15
Phthalates only	Various	0/430	Various	0/171	Various	4/175

Table 1. Number of samples exceeding any DMMP SL value, number of samples exceeding individual phthalate SL values, and number of samples only exceeding phthalate SLs. Dataset based on 52 past dredging project projects, 506 station locations (463 with detected chemicals of concern) and 1137 separate samples (671 with detected chemicals of concern). a = based on 1986 HAET, b = based on 1998 HAET, c = based on 1998 LAET.

The DMMP agencies believe strongly that best scientific information should be incorporated into evaluation, management and monitoring guidelines in a timely manner (notwithstanding limited resources). Scientific information pertaining to the evaluation of sediment quality is emerging at a rapid rate. Ecology's recent efforts to amend the SMS rule will ultimately result in revised and validated AET values that can be used to revise guideline values (8). The U.S. EPA will soon propose equilibrium partitioning-based sediment guidelines or "ESGs" (9). Taken altogether, these may lead the agencies to undertake a comprehensive revision of guidelines within the next year or two. Any future revision of DMMP guidelines will need to consider using sediment quality values, such as AETs, in a manner consistent with the SMS program and criteria.

References

1. PSDDA. 1986. Development of Sediment Quality values for Puget Sound. Volume I. Prepared for the PSDDA agencies by Tetra Tech, Inc.
2. U.S. EPA. 1988. Sediment Quality Values Refinement: Volume I. Update and Evaluation of Puget Sound AET. Prepared by PTI Environmental Services, Inc.
3. PSDDA. 1989. Management Plan Report. Unconfined Open-Water Disposal of Dredged Material, Phases I and II.
4. PSDDA. 1988. Evaluation Procedures Technical Appendix.
5. Regulatory Work Group. 1997. Recommendations Related to Future Evaluations of Apparent Effects Threshold and DMMP Guideline Values. Final Memorandum for Record.
6. Washington Department of Ecology. 1996. Progress Re-evaluating Puget Sound AETs. April 1996 Draft Report.
7. DMMP. 1997. Minutes to the 1997 Sediment Management Annual Review Meeting. [Revisions to DMMP Screening Level and Maximum Level Guidelines.](#)
8. Personal communications. 2000. EVS Consultants and Washington Department of Ecology, Sediment Management Unit.
9. U.S. EPA. 2000. Equilibrium Partitioning Sediment Guidelines (ESGs) for the Protection of Benthic Organisms. Various DRAFT Documents.